[[1]](#footnote-1)

Building Poker Bot with Reinforcement Learning (December 2020)

László Barak, Mónika Farsang, Ádám Szukics

*Abstract*—The abstract should not exceed 250 words. This example is 250 words. See instructions give you guidelines for preparing papers for IEEE Transactions and Journals*.* Use this document as a template if you are using Microsoft *Word* 6.0 or later. Otherwise, use this document as an instruction set. The electronic file of your paper will be formatted further at IEEE. Paper titles should be written in uppercase and lowercase letters, not all uppercase. Avoid writing long formulas with subscripts in the title; short formulas that identify the elements are fine (e.g., "Nd–Fe–B"). Do not write “(Invited)” in the title. Full names of authors are preferred in the author field, but are not required. Put a space between authors’ initials. The abstract must be a concise yet comprehensive reflection of what is in your article. In particular, the abstract must be self-contained, without abbreviations, footnotes, or references. It should be a microcosm of the full article. The abstract must be between 150–250 words. Be sure that you adhere to these limits; otherwise, you will need to edit your abstract accordingly. The abstract must be written as one paragraph, and should not contain displayed mathematical equations or tabular material. The abstract should include three or four different keywords or phrases, as this will help readers to find it. It is important to avoid over-repetition of such phrases as this can result in a page being rejected by search engines. Ensure that your abstract reads well and is grammatically correct.

*Impact Statement* — The impact statement should not exceeed 150 words. This section offers an example that is expanded to have only and just 150 words to demonstrate the point. Here is an example on how to write an appropriate impact statement: Chatbots are a popular technology in online interaction. They reduce the load on human support teams and offer continuous 24-7 support to customers. However, recent usability research has demonstrated that 30% of customers are unhappy with current chatbots due to their poor conversational capabilities and inability to emotionally engage customers. The natural language algorithms we introduce in this paper overcame these limitations. With a significant increase in user satisfaction to 92% after adopting our algorithms, the technology is ready to support users in a wide variety of applications including government front shops, automatic tellers, and the gaming industry. It could offer an alternative way of interaction for some physically disable users.

*Index Terms*—poker, reinforcement learning

Enter key words or phrases in alphabetical order, separated by commas. For a list of suggested keywords, send a blank e-mail to [keywords@ieee.org](mailto:keywords@ieee.org) or visit <http://www.ieee.org/organizations/pubs/ani_prod/keywrd98.txt>

# INTRODUCTION

T

HIS document is a template for Microsoft *Word* versions 6.0 or later. If you are reading a paper or PDF version of this document, please download the electronic file,  
trans\_jour.docx, from the IEEE Web site at [www.ieee.org/authortools](http://www.ieee.org/authortools) so you can use it to prepare your manuscript. If you would prefer to use LaTeX, download IEEE’s LaTeX style and sample files from the same Web page. You can also explore using the Overleaf editor at [https://www.overleaf.com/blog/278-how-to-use-overleaf-with-ieee-collabratec-your-quick-guide-to-getting-started#.Vp6tpPkrKM9](https://www.overleaf.com/blog/278-how-to-use-overleaf-with-ieee-collabratec-your-quick-guide-to-getting-started%23.Vp6tpPkrKM9)

If your paper is intended for a conference*,* please contact your conference editor concerning acceptable word processor formats for your particular conference.

The current results in reinforcement learning have always been important for humanity. Not so long ago we managed to reach what some considered to be impossible, namely beating the current best Go player by using artificial intelligence [1]. This was a huge milestone, even though perfect-information games were considered to be easier to solve than their imperfect-information counterparts. The reason for that is obvious: imperfect information games require more complex reasoning than similarly sized perfect information games. We have to balance our strategy so that our opponent does not find out too much about our way of playing, hereby the hidden information we have. To give an example, in poker if we always raise when we have a pair of kings, our opponents will recognize that and punish us for doing it, either by folding their cards or by raising if the current public cards favour them. As we can see from the previous example, poker is intuitively easy to understand and captures the challenges of hidden information effectively and elegantly. For this reason it has been widely used to illustrate game theory concepts. [2]

The classical solution for games is a Nash equilibrium. This strategy ensures that no player can increase his or her expected utility by altering their strategy. All finite extensive-form games have at least one Nash equilibrium. 

# Literature review

Poker and Reinforcement learning solutions

Literature Review is needed for the analysis of past studies or scholarly articles to be familiar with research questions or topics. Hence, this section summarizes and synthesizes arguments and ideas from scholarly sources without adding new contributions. In turn, this part is organized around arguments or ideas, not sources.

If you wish, you may write in the first person singular or plural and use the active voice (“I observed that ...” or “We observed that ...” instead of “It was observed that ...”). Remember to check spelling. If your native language is not English, please get a native English-speaking colleague to carefully proofread your paper.

In the past few years the media has been constantly covering breakthroughs in reinforcement learning. For example, in 2019 OpenAI Five [3] became the first AI system to defeat the world champions at an esports game. Some thought it was inevitable that the precision of the computers will outshine their human opponents, and it was bound to happen. Later that year Pluribus shocked the world: a superhuman AI has been made that managed to consistently beat human professional players. Beating humans in poker is not something we have not seen before.

First, in 2015 a paper claimed that Heads-up Limit Hold’em Poker is essentially solved. Cepheus (the name of the supercomputer) was trained for 68 days with CPUs, using a special version of counterfactual regret minimization. Cepheus heavily outperformed Polaris, the poker bot made in 2008. This triggered a snowball effect in the world of poker AIs.

In 2016 another paper [4] argued that their NFSP (Neural Fictitious Self-Play) is the first deep reinforcement learning method known to converge to approximate Nash equilibria in self-play.

In early 2017 DeepStack [5] achieved expert-level artificial intelligence in heads-up no-limit poker. It became the first poker ai that managed to beat professional poker players in heads-up no-limit texas hold’em. DeepStack allows computation to be focused on specific situations that arise when making decisions and the use of automatically trained value functions while using minimal domain knowledge.

To completely isolate these machines from humans, in 2018 Libratus [6] was created without any domain knowledge and also greatly reduced the required training time. It defeated four top human specialist professionals in a 120,000-hand competition in heads-up no-limit texas hold’em. It consisted of a blueprint strategy for the overall strategy, an algorithm that provided more information on the details of the strategy for subgames that were reached during play, and a self-improver algorithm that fixes potential weaknesses that the opponents might identify.

To top it all, in 2019 Pluribus [7] crushed multiple humans simultaneously. It was tested in six-player no-limit texas hold’em poker, the most commonly played poker format in the world.

# Methodology

Algorithm and environments

We used RLCard card environments [8] that are designed for reinforcement learning research. It is an easy-to-use toolkit that provides Limit Hold’em and Leduc Hold’em environment. The latter is a simplified version of Limit Texas Hold’em and it was constructed to have a more tractable game [9].

Both types have the same actions: *check, call*, *raise* and *fold*. During *checking* the action passes to the next player without betting. In the case of someone bets, this action is not possible anymore. *Calling* means matching a bet or a raise. If the player chooses to *raise*, he/she increases the size of an existing bet in the round. *Folding* is discarding one’s hand.

The payoff is identical as well in both environments. It is based on the big blinds per hand. The player gets the positive or negative R reward if he/she wins or loses R times the amount of the big blind, respectively.

Limit Hold’em is played with 52 cards. Each player has 2 hole cards and there are 5 community cards with 3 phases, called the *flop*, the *turn* and the *river*. The players have 4 *raise* actions per round each with 4 betting rounds in total. The state representation in this game is a vector of length 72. The first part contains the known cards, namely the hole cards and the already known community cards. The first 13 represents the cards from the Ace of Spade to the King of Spade, followed by the Heart, the Diamond and the Club similarly. The rest of the vector is the number of *raise* actions in each round.

Leduc Hold’em is limited to 6 cards, which are two pairs of King, Queen and Jack. This game is played by 2 players with 2 rounds, where there are 2 *raise* actions in the first one and 4 in the second one. The game is fixed with two-bet and 14 chips maximum.

We implemented a DQN agent in PyTorch. For this, we used the TensorFlow code from RLCard [10] as a base and created a more powerful, more manageable, and easy to use code in PyTorch. This implementation is an advanced Q-learning agent in two aspects. First, it uses a replay buffer to store past experiences, as we simulate the environment and make an action we add the state, action, reward, next state and whether game is done or not, then when we train our network we sample from that replay buffer for a more consistent result. Second, to make the training more stable, another Q-network is used as a target network in order to backpropagate through it and train the policy Q-network. These features were first described in [11].

These networks purpose is to estimate a Q-value given the current state, which can be used to determine which action the agent will take. They consist of a simple neural network with the number of states as it’s input layer and the number of actions as it’s output layer.

Every step the agent first makes an action based on the epsilion value which is responsible for exploration, if epsilion is high the agent is more likely to take a random action if it’s low it will use the Q-network to determine the best action. In the early stages of the game epsilion starts high “exploring” the environment and each step it’s reduced by a small amount to the point when it will be near 0.

The agent learns by sampling a minibatch from the replay memory and gets a Q-value for the next state using the policy network and determines the best action for this state. Then it determines the target Q-value using the target network, calculates the target action using the reward from the replay memory and the target Q-value, then backpropagates using this value.

First the agent will “explore” the environment making random actions and getting positive/negative rewards and updating its Q-network accordingly. But as it plays more and more it will take less random actions and has more accurate Q-values for the given states, playing better and better.

Furthermore, as an extra component, we added the opportunity of a more aggressive playing strategy. In case of the given action has the maximum q-value, the agent chooses the *raise* action as a replacement for it if *raising* is a valid action. Hence, the 3 possible extra settings are to encourage the agent to *raise* instead of *calling*, *checking* and *folding*. We investigate its impact on the performance of the agent.

# Results and Discussion

We trained the DQN agents with 215 different hyperparameter settings against random agents in both environments. During the hyperparameter tuning the number of layers, the replay memory size, the batch size, the discount factor and the learning rate were examined.

The best parameter combinations are shown in *Table I.* It is interesting to observe that 3 parameters, which are the replay memory size, the batch size and the discount factor, lead to the best performance in both environments. The differentiation comes from the parameter of the network layers and the learning rate.

Table I.

Tuned models

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Hyperparameter | Leduc Hold’em | Limit Hold’em |
| **network layers** | [128, 128, 128] | [128, 128] |
| replay memory | 2000 | 2000 |
| batch size | 64 | 64 |
| discount factor | 0.99 | 0.99 |
| **learning rate** | 0.1 | 0.001 |

Next, we investigate how the proposed agents affect the results in both environments. We trained them 1000 episodes long and in each tenth episode, they were evaluated with 100 games. The reward is calculated from the last 10 evaluations. and display the average rewards and their variance in Leduc Hold’em and Limit Hold’em.

The most important finding is that the different versions of the traditional DQN agent have an effect on the performance. Moreover, if the agent prefers *raising* to *calling*, the performance is significantly better.

In the case of the Leduc Hold’em environment, the DQN‑CAR algorithm exceeds the baseline DQN by more than 30% with respect to the achieved average reward. Meanwhile, the other two methods underperform the classical one.

Table II.

Best performance in Leduc Hold'em environment

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | mean reward | reward variance |
| DQN | 0.960 | 0.265 |
| **DQN-CAR** | **1.261** | **0.352** |
| DQN-CHR | 0.682 | 0.285 |
| DQN-FR | 0.723 | 0.202 |

Similar results come from the Limit Hold’em environment, where the DQN-CAR outperforms the DQN algorithm by almost 40% improvement.

Table III.

Best performance in Limit Hold'em environment

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | mean reward | reward variance | |
| DQN | 2.057 | | 0.258 |
| **DQN-CAR** | **2.870** | | **0.465** |
| DQN-CHR | 1.806 | | 0.433 |
| DQN-FR | 1.713 | | 0.276 |

These results with the proposed DQN-CAR algorithm against a random agent shows great performance in both environments. However, it is important to note its limitations. While the aggressive strategy works well against a random agent, the opposite can happen against a stronger opponent. As suggested from [8], the problem of the DQN policy is that it may be highly exploitable since it is easy to find its weaknesses. Indeed, if we train the algorithms against a pre-trained NFSP agent, their performance drops drastically. These evaluation results are shown in

Table IV.

Performance against pre-trained agent in Leduc Hold’em

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | mean reward | reward variance | |
| DQN | -0.049 | | 0.350 |
| DQN-CAR | 0.023 | | 0.350 |
| DQN-CHR | 0.093 | | 0.353 |
| DQN-FR | -0.001 | | 0.3671 |

The 3 new methods slightly perform better than the classical DQN, but the differences are not considerable. These results with playing against the pre-trained NFSP agent show that the DQN algorithm is not able to adapt in stochastic environments. They also support the findings in recent research [8][11]. It would be worth investigating the same question in the Limit Hold’em environment with a strong pre-trained agent, but such a model is not yet presented for this environment. However, the team of the RLCard proposed to develop more pre-trained agents in the future [8]. Of course, it is possible to train a strong agent with NFSP or CFR by ourself but it was not part of our research.

# Conclusions

What findings did we make.

…

Our agents have excellent performance against random agents but not against pre-trained agents. Because of this, we recommend our poker bot for children and beginner level players especially.

Conclusion includes final claims of a research paper based on findings. Basically, this section covers final thoughts and the summary of the whole work. Moreover, this section may be used instead of limitations and recommendations that would be too small by themselves. In this case, scientists do not need to use headings for recommendations and limitations.

## Types of Graphics

The following list outlines the different types of graphics published in IEEE journals. They are categorized based on their construction, and use of color / shades of gray:

### *Color/Grayscale figures*

### Figures that are meant to appear in color, or shades of black/gray. Such figures may include photographs, illustrations, multicolor graphs, and flowcharts.

### *Line Art figures*

### Figures that are composed of only black lines and shapes. These figures should have no shades or half-tones of gray, only black and white.

### *Author photos*

### Head and shoulders shots of authors that appear at the end of our papers.

### *Tables* Data charts which are typically black and white, but sometimes include color.

## Multipart figures

Figures compiled of more than one sub-figure presented side-by-side, or stacked. If a multipart figure is made up of multiple figure types (one part is lineart, and another is grayscale or color) the figure should meet the stricter guidelines.

## File Formats For Graphics

Format and save your graphics using a suitable graphics processing program that will allow you to create the images as PostScript (PS), Encapsulated PostScript (.EPS), Tagged Image File Format (.TIFF), Portable Document Format (.PDF), or Portable Network Graphics (.PNG) sizes them, and adjusts the resolution settings. If you created your source files in one of the following programs you will be able to submit the graphics without converting to a PS, EPS, TIFF, PDF, or PNG file: Microsoft Word, Microsoft PowerPoint, or Microsoft Excel. Though it is not required, it is strongly recommended that these files be saved in PDF format rather than DOC, XLS, or PPT. Doing so will protect your figures from common font and arrow stroke issues that occur when working on the files across multiple platforms. When submitting your final paper, your graphics should all be submitted individually in one of these formats along with the manuscript.

## Sizing of Graphics

Most charts, graphs, and tables are one column wide (3.5 inches / 88 millimeters / 21 picas) or page wide (7.16 inches / 181 millimeters / 43 picas). The maximum depth a graphic can be is 8.5 inches (216 millimeters / 54 picas). When choosing the depth of a graphic, please allow space for a caption. Figures can be sized between column and page widths if the author chooses, however it is recommended that figures are not sized less than column width unless when necessary.

There is currently one publication with column measurements that do not coincide with those listed above. Proceedings of the IEEE has a column measurement of 3.25 inches (82.5 millimeters / 19.5 picas).

The final printed size of author photographs is exactly   
1 inch wide by 1.25 inches tall (25.4 millimeters x 31.75 millimeters / 6 picas x 7.5 picas). Author photos printed in editorials measure 1.59 inches wide by 2 inches tall (40 millimeters x 50 millimeters / 9.5 picas x 12 picas).

## Resolution

The proper resolution of your figures will depend on the type of figure it is as defined in the “Types of Figures” section. Author photographs, color, and grayscale figures should be at least 300dpi. Line art, including tables should be a minimum of 600dpi.

## Vector Art

In order to preserve the figures’ integrity across multiple computer platforms, we accept files in the following formats: .EPS/.PDF/.PS. All fonts must be embedded or text converted to outlines in order to achieve the best-quality results.

## Color Space

The term color space refers to the entire sum of colors that can be represented within the said medium. For our purposes, the three main color spaces are Grayscale, RGB (red/green/blue) and CMYK (cyan/magenta/yellow/black). RGB is generally used with on-screen graphics, whereas CMYK is used for printing purposes.

All color figures should be generated in RGB or CMYK color space. Grayscale images should be submitted in Grayscale color space. Line art may be provided in grayscale OR bitmap colorspace. Note that “bitmap colorspace” and “bitmap file format” are not the same thing. When bitmap color space is selected, .TIF/.TIFF/.PNG are the recommended file formats.

## Accepted Fonts Within Figures

When preparing your graphics IEEE suggests that you use of one of the following Open Type fonts: Times New Roman, Helvetica, Arial, Cambria, and Symbol. If you are supplying EPS, PS, or PDF files all fonts must be embedded. Some fonts may only be native to your operating system; without the fonts embedded, parts of the graphic may be distorted or missing.

A safe option when finalizing your figures is to strip out the fonts before you save the files, creating “outline” type. This converts fonts to artwork what will appear uniformly on any screen.

## Using Labels Within Figures

### Figure Axis labels

Figure axis labels are often a source of confusion. Use words rather than symbols. As an example, write the quantity “Magnetization,” or “Magnetization *M*,” not just “*M*.” Put units in parentheses. Do not label axes only with units. As in Fig. 1, for example, write “Magnetization (A/m)” or “Magnetization (Am−1),” not just “A/m.” Do not label axes with a ratio of quantities and units. For example, write “Temperature (K),” not “Temperature/K.”

Multipliers can be especially confusing. Write “Magnetization (kA/m)” or “Magnetization (103 A/m).” Do not write “Magnetization (A/m) × 1000” because the reader would not know whether the top axis label in Fig. 1 meant 16000 A/m or 0.016 A/m. Figure labels should be legible, approximately 8 to 10 point type.

### Subfigure Labels in Multipart Figures and Tables

Multipart figures should be combined and labeled before final submission. Labels should appear centered below each subfigure in 8 point Times New Roman font in the format of (a) (b) (c).

## File Naming

Figures (line artwork or photographs) should be named starting with the first 5 letters of the author’s last name. The next characters in the filename should be the number that represents the sequential location of this image in your article. For example, in author “Anderson’s” paper, the first three figures would be named ander1.tif, ander2.tif, and ander3.ps.

Tables should contain only the body of the table (not the caption) and should be named similarly to figures, except that ‘.t’ is inserted in-between the author’s name and the table number. For example, author Anderson’s first three tables would be named ander.t1.tif, ander.t2.ps, ander.t3.eps.

Author photographs should be named using the first five characters of the pictured author’s last name. For example, four author photographs for a paper may be named: oppen.ps, moshc.tif, chen.eps, and duran.pdf.

If two authors or more have the same last name, their first initial(s) can be substituted for the fifth, fourth, third... letters of their surname until the degree where there is differentiation. For example, two authors Michael and Monica Oppenheimer’s photos would be named oppmi.tif, and oppmo.eps.

## Referencing a Figure or Table Within Your Paper

When referencing your figures and tables within your paper, use the abbreviation “Fig.” even at the beginning of a sentence. Do not abbreviate “Table.” Tables should be numbered with Roman Numerals.

## Checking Your Figures: The IEEE Graphics Analyzer

The IEEE Graphics Analyzer enables authors to pre-screen their graphics for compliance with IEEE Transactions and Journals standards before submission. The online tool, located at <http://graphicsqc.ieee.org/>, allows authors to upload their graphics in order to check that each file is the correct file format, resolution, size and colorspace; that no fonts are missing or corrupt; that figures are not compiled in layers or have transparency, and that they are named according to the IEEE Transactions and Journals naming convention. At the end of this automated process, authors are provided with a detailed report on each graphic within the web applet, as well as by email.

For more information on using the Graphics Analyzer   
or any other graphics related topic, contact the IEEE Graphics Help Desk by e-mail at [graphics@ieee.org](mailto:graphics@ieee.org).

## Submitting Your Graphics

Because IEEE will do the final formatting of your paper,   
you do not need to position figures and tables at the top and bottom of each column. In fact, all figures, figure captions, and tables can be placed at the end of your paper. In addition to, or even in lieu of submitting figures within your final manuscript, figures should be submitted individually, separate from the manuscript in one of the file formats listed above in section VI-J. Place figure captions below the figures; place table titles above the tables. Please do not include captions as part of the figures, or put them in “text boxes” linked to the figures. Also, do not place borders around the outside of your figures.

## Color Processing / Printing in IEEE Journals

All IEEE Transactions, Journals, and Letters allow an author to publish color figures on IEEE *Xplore*® at no charge, and automatically convert them to grayscale for print versions. In most journals, figures and tables may alternatively be printed in color if an author chooses to do so. Please note that this service comes at an extra expense to the author. If you intend to have print color graphics, include a note with your final paper indicating which figures or tables you would like to be handled that way, and stating that you are willing to pay the additional fee.

Appendix

Appendixes, if needed, appear before the acknowledgment.

Acknowledgment

The preferred spelling of the word “acknowledgment” in American English is without an “e” after the “g.” Use the singular heading even if you have many acknowledgments. Avoid expressions such as “One of us (S.B.A.) would like to thank ... .” Instead, write “F. A. Author thanks ... .” In most cases, sponsor and financial support acknowledgments are placed in the unnumbered footnote on the first page, not here.

References and Footnotes

## References

References need not be cited in text. When they are, they appear on the line, in square brackets, inside the punctuation. Multiple references are each numbered with separate brackets. When citing a section in a book, please give the relevant page numbers. In text, refer simply to the reference number. Do not use “Ref.” or “reference” except at the beginning of a sentence: “Reference [3] shows ... .” Please do not use automatic endnotes in *Word*, rather, type the reference list at the end of the paper using the “References” style.

Reference numbers are set flush left and form a column of their own, hanging out beyond the body of the reference. The reference numbers are on the line, enclosed in square brackets. In all references, the given name of the author or editor is abbreviated to the initial only and precedes the last name. Use them all; use *et al*. only if names are not given. Use commas around Jr., Sr., and III in names. Abbreviate conference titles. When citing IEEE transactions, provide the issue number, page range, volume number, year, and/or month if available. When referencing a patent, provide the day and the month of issue, or application. References may not include all information; please obtain and include relevant information. Do not combine references. There must be only one reference with each number. If there is a URL included with the print reference, it can be included at the end of the reference.

Other than books, capitalize only the first word in a paper title, except for proper nouns and element symbols. For papers published in translation journals, please give the English citation first, followed by the original foreign-language citation See the end of this document for formats and examples of common references. For a complete discussion of references and their formats, see the IEEE style manual at [www.ieee.org/authortools](http://www.ieee.org/authortools).

References

10 references come here

*Basic format for books:*

J. K. Author, “Title of chapter in the book,” in *Title of His Published Book, x*th ed. City of Publisher, (only U.S. State), Country: Abbrev. of Publisher, year, ch. *x*, sec. *x*, pp. *xxx–xxx.*

*Examples:*

1. David Silver, Thomas Hubert, Julian Schrittwieser, Ioannis Antonoglou, Matthew Lai, Arthur Guez, Marc Lanctot, Laurent Sifre, Dharshan Kumaran, Thore Graepel, Timothy Lillicrap, Karen Simonyan, Demis Hassabis, “Mastering Chess and Shogi by Self-Play with a General Reinforcement Learning Algorithm”,2017, Available: arXiv:1712.01815
2. John von Neumann, “Theory of Parlor Games”, 1928
3. Christopher Berner, Greg Brockman, Brooke Chan, Vicki Cheung, Przemysław “Psyho" Dębiak, Christy Dennison, David Farhi, Quirin Fischer, Shariq Hashme, Chris Hesse, Rafal Józefowicz, Scott Gray, Catherine Olsson, Jakub Pachocki, Michael Petrov, Henrique Pondé de Oliveira Pinto, Jonathan Raiman, Tim Salimans, Jeremy Schlatter, Jonas Schneider, Szymon Sidor, Ilya Sutskever, Jie Tang, Filip Wolski, Susan Zhang, “Dota 2 with Large Scale Deep Reinforcement Learning,” 2019, Available: arXiv[:](https://arxiv.org/abs/1912.06680)1912[.](https://arxiv.org/abs/1912.06680)06680
4. Johannes Heinrich,David Silver, “Deep Reinforcement Learning from Self-Play in Imperfect-Information Games,” 2016, Available: arXiv:1603.01121
5. Matej Moravcik,Martin Schmid,Neil Burch,Viliam Lisy,Dustin Morrill,Nolan Bard,Trevor Davis,Kevin Waugh,Michael Johanson,Michael Bowling “DeepStack: Expert-Level Artificial Intelligence in Heads-Up No-Limit Poker,” 2017, Available: arXiv:1701.01724v3
6. Noam Brown, Tuomas Sandholm, “Superhuman AI for heads-up no-limit poker: Libratus beats top professionals,” 2018, Available: Science,  359, 418–424 (2018)
7. Noam Brown, Tuomas Sandholm, “Superhuman AI for multiplayer poker,” 2018, Available: Science,   365 (6456), 885-890 (2019)
8. Daochen Zha, Kwei-Herng Lai, Yuanpu Cao, Songyi Huang, Ruzhe Wei, Junyu Guo and Xia Hu, “RLCard: A Toolkit for Reinforcement Learning in Card Games,” 2020, [Online]. Available: arXiv:1910.04376.
9. Finnegan Southey, Michael P. Bowling, Bryce Larson, Carmelo Piccione, Neil Burch, Darse Billings and Chris Rayner, “Bayes' Bluff: Opponent Modelling in Poker,” 2012, [Online]. Available: arXiv:1207.1411
10. DATA Lab at Texas A&M University (2020) RLCard [Source code]. <https://github.com/datamllab/rlcard>
11. V. Mnih, K. Kavukcuoglu, D. Silver, “Human-level control through deep reinforcement learning,” *Nature* 518, 529–533, Feb. 2015.
12. W.-K. Chen, *Linear Networks and Systems.* Belmont, CA, USA: Wadsworth, 1993, pp. 123–135.

*Basic format for periodicals:*

J. K. Author, “Name of paper,” *Abbrev. Title of Periodical*, vol. *x, no*. *x,* pp*. xxx-xxx,* Abbrev. Month, year, DOI. 10.1109.*XXX*.123456.

*Examples:*

1. J. U. Duncombe, “Infrared navigation—Part I: An assessment of feasibility,” *IEEE Trans. Electron Devices*, vol. ED-11, no. 1, pp. 34–39, Jan. 1959, 10.1109/TED.2016.2628402.
2. E. P. Wigner, “Theory of traveling-wave optical laser,”   
   *Phys. Rev*.,   
   vol. 134, pp. A635–A646, Dec. 1965.
3. E. H. Miller, “A note on reflector arrays,” *IEEE Trans. Antennas Propagat*., to be published.

*Basic format for reports:*

J. K. Author, “Title of report,” Abbrev. Name of Co., City of Co., Abbrev. State, Country, Rep. *xxx*, year.

*Examples:*

1. E. E. Reber, R. L. Michell, and C. J. Carter, “Oxygen absorption in the earth’s atmosphere,” Aerospace Corp., Los Angeles, CA, USA, Tech. Rep. TR-0200 (4230-46)-3, Nov. 1988.
2. J. H. Davis and J. R. Cogdell, “Calibration program for the 16-foot antenna,” Elect. Eng. Res. Lab., Univ. Texas, Austin, TX, USA, Tech. Memo. NGL-006-69-3, Nov. 15, 1987.

*Basic format for handbooks:*

*Name of Manual/Handbook, x* ed., Abbrev. Name of Co., City of Co., Abbrev. State, Country, year, pp. *xxx-xxx.*

*Examples:*

1. *Transmission Systems for Communications*, 3rd ed., Western Electric Co., Winston-Salem, NC, USA, 1985, pp. 44–60.
2. *Motorola Semiconductor Data Manual*, Motorola Semiconductor Products Inc., Phoenix, AZ, USA, 1989.

*Basic format for books (when available online):*

J. K. Author, “Title of chapter in the book,” in *Title of Published Book*, *x*th ed. City of Publisher, State, Country: Abbrev. of Publisher, year, ch. *x*, sec. *x*, pp. *xxx–xxx*. [Online]. Available: http://www.web.com

*Examples:*

1. G. O. Young, “Synthetic structure of industrial plastics,” in Plastics, vol. 3, Polymers of Hexadromicon, J. Peters, Ed., 2nd ed. New York, NY, USA: McGraw-Hill, 1964, pp. 15-64. [Online]. Available: http://www.bookref.com.
2. *The Founders’ Constitution*, Philip B. Kurland and Ralph Lerner, eds., Chicago, IL, USA: Univ. Chicago Press, 1987. [Online]. Available: http://press-pubs.uchicago.edu/founders/
3. The Terahertz Wave eBook. ZOmega Terahertz Corp., 2014. [Online]. Available: http://dl.z-thz.com/eBook/zomega\_ebook\_pdf\_1206\_sr.pdf. Accessed on: May 19, 2014.
4. Philip B. Kurland and Ralph Lerner, eds., *The Founders’ Constitution.* Chicago, IL, USA: Univ. of Chicago Press, 1987, Accessed on: Feb. 28, 2010, [Online] Available: http://press-pubs.uchicago.edu/founders/

*Basic format for journals (when available online):*

J. K. Author, “Name of paper,” *Abbrev. Title of Periodical*, vol. *x*, no. *x*, pp. *xxx-xxx*, Abbrev. Month, year. Accessed on: Month, Day, year, DOI: 10.1109.*XXX*.123456, [Online].

*Examples:*

1. J. S. Turner, “New directions in communications,” *IEEE J. Sel. Areas Commun*., vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 11-23, Jan. 1995.
2. W. P. Risk, G. S. Kino, and H. J. Shaw, “Fiber-optic frequency shifter using a surface acoustic wave incident at an oblique angle,” *Opt. Lett.*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 115–117, Feb. 1986.
3. P. Kopyt *et al., “*Electric properties of graphene-based conductive layers from DC up to terahertz range,” *IEEE THz Sci. Technol.,* to be published. DOI: 10.1109/TTHZ.2016.2544142.

*Basic format for papers presented at conferences (when available online):*

J.K. Author. (year, month). Title. presented at abbrev. conference title. [Type of Medium]. Available: site/path/file

*Example:*

1. PROCESS Corporation, Boston, MA, USA. Intranets: Internet technologies deployed behind the firewall for corporate productivity. Presented at INET96 Annual Meeting. [Online]. Available: http://home.process.com/Intranets/wp2.htp

*Basic format for reports and handbooks (when available online):*

J. K. Author. “Title of report,” Company. City, State, Country. Rep. no., (optional: vol./issue), Date. [Online] Available: site/path/file

*Examples:*

1. R. J. Hijmans and J. van Etten, “Raster: Geographic analysis and modeling with raster data,” R Package Version 2.0-12, Jan. 12, 2012. [Online]. Available: http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=raster
2. Teralyzer. Lytera UG, Kirchhain, Germany [Online]. Available: http://www.lytera.de/Terahertz\_THz\_Spectroscopy.php?id=home, Accessed on: Jun. 5, 2014

*Basic format for computer programs and electronic documents (when available online):*

Legislative body. Number of Congress, Session. (year, month day). *Number of bill or resolution*, *Title*. [Type of medium]. Available: site/path/file

***NOTE:*** ISO recommends that capitalization follow the accepted practice for the language or script in which the information is given.

*Example:*

1. U.S. House. 102nd Congress, 1st Session. (1991, Jan. 11). *H. Con. Res. 1, Sense of the Congress on Approval of Military Action*. [Online]. Available: LEXIS Library: GENFED File: BILLS

*Basic format for patents (when available online):*

Name of the invention, by inventor’s name. (year, month day). Patent Number[Type of medium]. Available: site/path/file

*Example:*

1. Musical toothbrush with mirror, by L.M.R. Brooks. (1992, May 19). Patent D 326 189

[Online]. Available: NEXIS Library: LEXPAT File: DES

*Basic format for conference proceedings (published):*

J. K. Author, “Title of paper,” in *Abbreviated Name of Conf.*, City of Conf., Abbrev. State (if given), Country, year, pp. *xxxxxx.*

*Example:*

1. D. B. Payne and J. R. Stern, “Wavelength-switched pas- sively coupled single-mode optical network,” in *Proc. IOOC-ECOC,* Boston, MA, USA,1985,   
   pp. 585–590.

*Example for papers presented at conferences (unpublished):*

1. D. Ebehard and E. Voges, “Digital single sideband detection for interferometric sensors,” presented at the *2nd Int. Conf. Optical Fiber Sensors,* Stuttgart, Germany, Jan. 2-5, 1984.

*Basic format for patents:*

J. K. Author, “Title of patent,” U.S. Patent *x xxx xxx*, Abbrev. Month, day, year.

*Example:*

1. G. Brandli and M. Dick, “Alternating current fed power supply,” U.S. Patent 4 084 217, Nov. 4, 1978.

*Basic format**for theses (M.S.) and dissertations (Ph.D.):*

a) J. K. Author, “Title of thesis,” M.S. thesis, Abbrev. Dept., Abbrev. Univ., City of Univ., Abbrev. State, year.

b) J. K. Author, “Title of dissertation,” Ph.D. dissertation, Abbrev. Dept., Abbrev. Univ., City of Univ., Abbrev. State, year.

*Examples:*

1. J. O. Williams, “Narrow-band analyzer,” Ph.D. dissertation, Dept. Elect. Eng., Harvard Univ., Cambridge, MA, USA, 1993.
2. N. Kawasaki, “Parametric study of thermal and chemical nonequilibrium nozzle flow,” M.S. thesis, Dept. Electron. Eng., Osaka Univ., Osaka, Japan, 1993.

*Basic format for the most common types of unpublished references:*

a) J. K. Author, private communication, Abbrev. Month, year.

b) J. K. Author, “Title of paper,” unpublished.

c) J. K. Author, “Title of paper,” to be published.

*Examples:*

1. A. Harrison, private communication, May 1995.
2. B. Smith, “An approach to graphs of linear forms,” unpublished.
3. A. Brahms, “Representation error for real numbers in binary computer arithmetic,” IEEE Computer Group Repository, Paper R-67-85.

*Basic formats for standards:*

a) *Title of Standard*, Standard number, date.

b) *Title of Standard*, Standard number, Corporate author, location, date.

*Examples:*

1. IEEE Criteria for Class IE Electric Systems, IEEE Standard 308, 1969.
2. Letter Symbols for Quantities, ANSI Standard Y10.5-1968.

*Article number in reference examples:*

1. R. Fardel, M. Nagel, F. Nuesch, T. Lippert, and A. Wokaun, “Fabrication of organic light emitting diode pixels by laser-assisted forward transfer,” *Appl. Phys. Lett.*, vol. 91, no. 6, Aug. 2007, Art. no. 061103.
2. J. Zhang and N. Tansu, “Optical gain and laser characteristics of InGaN quantum wells on ternary InGaN substrates,” *IEEE Photon. J.*, vol. 5, no. 2, Apr. 2013, Art. no. 2600111

*Example when using et al.:*

1. S. Azodolmolky *et al.*, Experimental demonstration of an impairment aware network planning and operation tool for transparent/translucent optical networks,” *J. Lightw. Technol.*, vol. 29, no. 4, pp. 439–448, Sep. 2011.

**First A. Author** (M’76–SM’81–F’87) and all authors may include biographies. Biographies are often not included in conference-related papers. This author became a Member (M) of IEEE in 1976, a Senior Member (SM) in 1981, and a Fellow (F) in 1987. The first paragraph may contain a place and/or date of birth (list place, then date). Next, the author’s educational background is listed. The degrees should be listed with type of degree in what field, which institution, city, state, and country, and year the degree was earned. The author’s major field of study should be lower-cased.

The second paragraph uses the pronoun of the person (he or she) and not the author’s last name. It lists military and work experience, including summer and fellowship jobs. Job titles are capitalized. The current job must have a location; previous positions may be listed without one. Information concerning previous publications may be included. Try not to list more than three books or published articles. The format for listing publishers of a book within the biography is: title of book (publisher name, year) similar to a reference. Current and previous research interests end the paragraph.

The third paragraph begins with the author’s title and last name (e.g., Dr. Smith, Prof. Jones, Mr. Kajor, Ms. Hunter). List any memberships in professional societies other than the IEEE. Finally, list any awards and work for IEEE committees and publications. If a photograph is provided, it should be of good quality, and professional-looking. Following are two examples of an author’s biography.

**Second B. Author** was born in Greenwich Village, New York, NY, USA in 1977. He received the B.S. and M.S. degrees in aerospace engineering from the University of Virginia, Charlottesville, in 2001 and the Ph.D. degree in mechanical engineering from Drexel University, Philadelphia, PA, in 2008.

From 2001 to 2004, he was a Research Assistant with the Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory. Since 2009, he has been an Assistant Professor with the Mechanical Engineering Department, Texas A&M University, College Station. He is the author of three books, more than 150 articles, and more than 70 inventions. His research interests include high-pressure and high-density nonthermal plasma discharge processes and applications, microscale plasma discharges, discharges in liquids, spectroscopic diagnostics, plasma propulsion, and innovation plasma applications. He is an Associate Editor of the journal *Earth*, *Moon*, *Planets*, and holds two patents.

Dr. Author was a recipient of the International Association of Geomagnetism and Aeronomy Young Scientist Award for Excellence in 2008, and the IEEE Electromagnetic Compatibility Society Best Symposium Paper Award in 2011.

**Third C. Author, Jr.** (M’87) received the B.S. degree in mechanical engineering from National Chung Cheng University, Chiayi, Taiwan, in 2004 and the M.S. degree in mechanical engineering from National Tsing Hua University, Hsinchu, Taiwan, in 2006. He is currently pursuing the Ph.D. degree in mechanical engineering at Texas A&M University, College Station, TX, USA.

From 2008 to 2009, he was a Research Assistant with the Institute of Physics, Academia Sinica, Tapei, Taiwan. His research interest includes the development of surface processing and biological/medical treatment techniques using nonthermal atmospheric pressure plasmas, fundamental study of plasma sources, and fabrication of micro- or nanostructured surfaces.

Mr. Author’s awards and honors include the Frew Fellowship (Australian Academy of Science), the I. I. Rabi Prize (APS), the European Frequency and Time Forum Award, the Carl Zeiss Research Award, the William F. Meggers Award and the Adolph Lomb Medal (OSA).

1. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)